



# Appendices



## Appendix 1

### *Proposed Commonwealth Action Plan for Increasing the Representation of Women in Politics*

Action	Government	Commonwealth Secretariat	Political Parties	Women in Parliament	Civil Society
A <i>Setting Targets</i>	Ministers agree on target(s) in Trinidad and Tobago Seek endorsement at CHOGM 1997 Monitor and publicise programme	Facilitate work of task team and tabling of target(s) at CHOGM 1997 Monitor and publicise progress	Support target(s)	Support/lobby for target(s) Monitor progress	Support/lobby for target(s) Monitor progress
B <i>Affirmative Action</i>	Identify the most appropriate form of affirmative action	Carry out a study on "best practices" of affirmative action	Adopt affirmative action within parties and ensure this is achieved	Lobby for affirmative action	Lobby government and political parties to take affirmative action measures
C <i>Review of Electoral Systems</i>	Review impact of electoral systems on representation of women in politics and take corrective measures	Carry out a comparative study of the effect of different electoral systems on the representation of women in politics	Participate in review of electoral systems	Lobby for review of electoral systems	Lobby for/monitor the review of the electoral systems
D <i>Public Awareness Campaign</i>	Launch a national campaign around the target(s)	Launch a Commonwealth-wide campaign around the target(s)	Encourage positive images of women in advertising campaigns Publicise and affirm target(s) for women	Engage with the media in publicising the work of women parliamentarians	Assist in the public awareness campaign, especially in remote communities
E <i>Encourage Women into Politics</i>	Initiate campaigns and develop simple guidebooks Work with electoral authorities on gender sensitive voter education materials	Assist in developing/facilitating exchanges of materials	Encourage women to take leadership roles in parties as a spring board to elections Adopt IPU Guidelines on women's wings of political parties	Address women's groups, help demystify politics	Mount campaigns to interest women in politics
F <i>Support for Women Candidates</i>	Support training and mentorship programmes for women candidates Initiate and publicise research on women's voting patterns and performance of women candidates	Develop education materials including distance education materials for women candidates	Provide in-house training and mentorship for women candidates Offer financial support	Become mentors to candidates Lobby for funds for women candidates in political parties	Initiate training and mentorship programmes Establish foundations to offer non-partisan financial support for women candidates

<b>Action</b>	<b>Government</b>	<b>Commonwealth Secretariat</b>	<b>Political Parties</b>	<b>Women in Parliament</b>	<b>Civil Society</b>
G <b><i>Support for Women Parliamentarians</i></b>	Support on-the-job training initiatives for women parliamentarians Work with women's caucuses in formulating gender sensitive legislation	Develop training materials for women leaders Working with the CWPG in supporting and networking with women's caucuses	Back women parliamentarians Continue training and mentorship programmes	Get organised Carry out needs analysis Set out concrete action plans	Provide relevant training and support to women parliamentarians

## Appendix 2

### *Tools for Integrating Gender Issues into National Budgetary Policies and Procedures within the Context of Economic Reform*

#### Tool 1

### **Gender-Disaggregated Beneficiary Assessment of Public Service Delivery and Budget Priorities**

#### Aim

To collect and analyse the opinions of men and women on how far current forms of public service delivery meet their needs and how far current patterns of public expenditure accord with their priorities.

#### Instruments

Opinion polls, attitude surveys, participatory rapid appraisal processes (including focus group discussions, participant observation, semi-structured and conversational interviewing, preference ranking and scoring, institutional diagramming).

Opinion polls and attitude surveys are quantitative instruments which address individuals in isolation. They are statistically representative, but the views generated do not benefit from a process of discussion and reflection, and may therefore be ill-informed, transitory and inconsistent.

Participatory rapid appraisal processes are qualitative instruments which provide for collective analysis and discussion of the issues under consideration and facilitate a process of social learning. The views generated do benefit from a process of discussion and reflection, however they are not statistically representative.

#### Examples of Use

In the UK, opinion polls and attitude surveys have been used to investigate people's perceptions of public expenditure.

- Peter Kellner, "What Does the Public Think?" and John Hall *et al* "How Public Attitudes to Expenditure Differ" in Dan Corry (ed.) *Public Expenditure – Effective Management and Control*, Dryden Press, London, 1997.

In a variety of developing countries including South Africa and Sri Lanka, participatory assessments have been made of poverty and public expenditure with the assistance of the World Bank.

- Andrew Norton and Thomas Stephens, *Participation in Poverty Assessments*, Environment Department Papers, World Bank, Washington DC, 1995.

To date, beneficiary assessments have not routinely been designed to be gender-disaggregated, though they have been disaggregated by region, class, political affiliation etc.

## Institutional Stakeholders

### 1 *Who can use these instruments?*

Opinion polls and attitude surveys will be useful to the Ministries of Finance and Women's Affairs when concerned with the full range of public expenditure and by sectoral ministries when concerned with specific expenditures and services.

Participatory rapid appraisal processes will be useful to the non-governmental organisations and community based organisations.

### 2 *Who can develop these instruments?*

Opinion polls and attitude surveys are normally designed by specialised public or private sector research organisations

Participatory rapid appraisal processes are normally implemented through non-governmental organisations at the grass roots level.

The Ministry of Women's Affairs and Parliamentary Committees could provide a forum for beneficiaries to discuss public expenditure priorities, for example, the organisation of a Budget Hearing to examine the national budget from a gender perspective.

## Implementation

Establish what use has already been made of the instrument in the country.

Refine the instrument and use it to:

- i gather and analyse gender-disaggregated views;
- ii create a process in which women feel comfortable in expressing their views; and
- iii identify the different needs and priorities of men and women.

Analyse the data to provide a separate assessment for men and women; with further cross-cutting disaggregations by class, region, ethnicity and other relevant differences.

Review the findings within each relevant ministry and identify the necessary changes to be made in the expenditure.

Publicise the findings widely and encourage public debate about their implications.

# Gender-Disaggregated Public Expenditure Benefit Incidence Analysis

## Aim

To analyse the extent to which men and women, girls and boys, benefit from expenditure on publicly provided services.

## Instruments

### *Benefit incidence analysis*

This quantitative tool reveals what has been the historical gender specific distribution of benefits from public services. It is particularly valuable for establishing base lines and setting up monitoring systems.

This requires the measurement of: i) the unit costs of providing a particular service – e.g. the costs of providing a primary school place for one year; ii) the number of units utilised by men and women, boys and girls.

Benefit incidence can then be calculated as the value of the unit costs multiplied by the number of units utilised by the relevant individuals. The benefit incidence depends upon: i) the allocation of public expenditure in providing public services; ii) the behaviour of households in utilising public services.

### *Example for Primary Education*

The incidence of benefit of public expenditure on primary education is: i) for girls, the value of public spending on primary education multiplied by the ratio of girls' enrolment in primary school to total enrolment in primary school; ii) for boys, the value of public spending on primary education multiplied by the ratio of boys' enrolment to total enrolment in primary school.

## Examples of Use

Benefit incidence analysis is a well-established approach in estimating the distribution of public expenditure.

- Jacob Meerman, *Public Expenditures in Malaysia – Who Benefits and Why?* Oxford University Press, New York and London, 1979.

Until recently most benefit incidence studies did not report gender-based disaggregations. But this is changing. A recent study for Ghana was gender-disaggregated.

- Lionel Demery, Shiyun Chao, Rene Bernier and Kalpana Mehra, "The Incidence of Social Spending in Ghana," *PSP Discussion Paper Series No. 82*, Poverty and Social Policy Department, World Bank, 1995.

## Institutional Stakeholders

### 1 *Who will use these instruments?*

The Ministry of Finance and those ministries responsible for, or involved in, providing public services.

### 2 *Who will develop these instruments?*

The central statistical office and the Ministry of Finance are normally best able to design these instruments. Public expenditure benefit incidence calculations require access to data on public expenditure and on utilisation of services. The participation of the ministries supplying the services is thus essential, and generally also the participation of the Central Statistical Office. The calculations themselves can be made within government, or independent researchers can be commissioned to make them.

## Implementation

Establish what use has already been made of this instrument in the country concerned, and if so, whether the benefit incidence has been disaggregated by gender.

Gather a consistent set of data from different sources for measuring benefit incidence by gender.

To measure the amount of public expenditure on a particular service is complicated because of the operation of several tiers of government (e.g. local, regional, national) and by discrepancies in the data reported by different sources (e.g. the Ministry of Finance may report a different value than that reported by the ministry providing the service). Data on the utilisation of services may be obtained from government ministries providing the service, or from households surveys. The two sources may differ, and in some cases neither may provide gender-disaggregated data.

If the relevant data is not available, then develop procedures in place to generate the relevant information.

Calculate the gender-disaggregated benefit incidence.

Review the findings within each relevant ministry and identify the necessary changes in the expenditure pattern.

Publicise the findings widely and encourage public debate about their implications.

## Gender-Aware Policy Evaluation of Public Expenditure by Sector

### Aim

To evaluate the policies that underlie budget appropriations to identify their likely impact on men and women. Are the policies likely to reduce, increase, or leave unchanged the degree and pattern of gender differences?

### Instruments

Specification of an expected causal chain from planned public expenditure and the activities it supports, to expected intermediate outputs, to anticipated ultimate impact on men and women. This may be operationalised by the following methods:

- i a narrative of expected events e.g. a planned increase in public expenditure on education is expected to a) increase school enrolment of girls (and reduce the gender gap in enrolment) and b) improve educational qualifications for girls (and a reduction in the gender gap in educational qualifications);
- ii a flow diagram;
- iii a check list of questions;
- iv a log frame analysis; and
- v programme performance budgeting.

One major weakness of this instrument is that the nature and scale of the links in the causal chain cannot be predicted with accuracy.

### *Example for Education*

A planned increase in public expenditure on primary education may not result in increased school enrolment of girls (and a reduction in the gender gap in enrolment between girls and boys) because of a) increases in family poverty which require mothers to spend more time in paid work (“productive work”) while daughters undertake the household tasks (“reproductive work”) or b) the low priority given to female education due to social and cultural factors.

It is therefore important to monitor and evaluate the results as expenditure takes place and to refine the policy for subsequent budgets in the light of what is learned.

## Examples of Use

### *Examples of gender-aware policy evaluation*

The UK government has instituted a process of policy appraisal for equal treatment.

- See, *Gender Integration and Mainstreaming in the United Kingdom Government's Policies and Programmes*, WAMM (96) (GMS) BRI, Commonwealth Meeting of Ministers Responsible for Women's Affairs, Trinidad and Tobago, November 1996.



In South Africa a joint initiative has been taken by a group of NGOs and the Parliamentary Joint Standing Committee on Finance to examine the likely gender impact of key areas of public expenditure (and also of taxation).

- See, Debbie Budlander (ed.) *The Women's Budget*, Institute for Democracy in South Africa, Cape Town, 1996.

Policy evaluation of various kinds has been used by governments, international financial institutions, parliamentary groups, NGOs and independent research institutes, but it has all too often been gender-blind.

- For a helpful discussion of policy evaluation in relation to public expenditure, see Geoff White, "Getting the Most Out of Public Expenditure" in Dan Corry (ed.) *Public Expenditure – Effective Management and Control*, Dryden Press, London, 1997.

## Institutional Stakeholders

There are a number of organisations within government and civil society which might appropriately conduct gender-aware policy evaluation of public expenditure. Given the inherent uncertainty about the nature and scale of the links in the causal chain, it is important that policy evaluation should be an open and consultative process. It is also important that different stakeholders evaluate expenditure policies. A two pronged-approach is recommended to ensure objectivity:

- i Each ministry should conduct a gender-aware policy evaluation of its planned expenditure prior to the budget, using a commonly agreed method. These evaluations could be brought together in an Annex to the Budget Statement.
- ii NGOs and research institutes should be encouraged and facilitated to carry out independent evaluations of expenditure policy.

## Implementation

Establish what use has already been made of the instrument in the country concerned.

Refine the instruments so that they can be used in a gender-aware manner. This requires transforming the conceptual framework with gender-disaggregation, so as to reveal causal links that are routinely omitted. The significance of unpaid reproductive work needs to be acknowledged in the evaluation.

Identify data requirements and data gaps and formulate a strategy for addressing the latter.

Conduct the policy evaluations.

Publicise the findings widely and encourage public debate about their implications.

Review the findings within each relevant ministry and consider what changes in expenditure are appropriate.

## Gender-Aware Budget (Expenditure) Statement

### Aim

To demonstrate the expected implications of the Expenditure Estimates in addressing issues of gender inequality in terms of total public expenditure and expenditure by sectoral ministries.

### Instruments

Disaggregation of projected expenditure into gender-relevant categories is the key instrument. Public expenditure is conventionally disaggregated:

- i by ministry and functional division
- ii by recurrent and capital expenses
- iii by “line-items” – e.g. personnel, equipment, fuel etc.

This makes it difficult to judge how far public expenditure priorities align with the needs of different groups of men and women; and how different groups of men and women are likely to benefit from the expenditure.

A variety of gender-relevant disaggregations may be made, presented in graphical as well as tabular form. Example:

#### 1 *Gender Equality Targeted Expenditure*

The share of expenditure which is targeted explicitly to women, to help redress past inequality and neglect, e.g. education and health programmes targeted at women and girls; equal opportunities initiatives in employment; programmes to support women’s businesses.

#### 2 *Women’s Priority Public Services*

The share of expenditure devoted to public services which have been identified of highest priority in reducing the burdens on women (especially poor women) and reducing gender gaps in health, education, income and leisure (even through not specifically targeted to women and girls). Example, primary education, primary health care, household water supply and sanitation facility, and rural electrification.

#### 3 *Gender Management System in Government*

The share of expenditure devoted to the Ministry of Women’s Affairs (or Office of Status of Women); Gender Equality Commission; Gender Focal Points in Ministries, etc.

#### 4 *Women’s Priority Income Transfers*

The share of expenditure devoted to income transfers which have been identified as of the highest priority in reducing women’s income inequality and dependence – e.g. child benefit, women’s pensions.

#### 5 *Gender Balance in Public Sector Employment*

For each ministry, shares of men and women in employment at each grade; the average earnings of women as a percentage of the average earnings of men in each grade.

## 6 Gender Balance in Business Support

The projected shares of men and women in expenditure directed to business support in agriculture, manufacturing and services (training, loans, subsidies etc.)

## 7 Gender Balance in Public Sector Contracts

Shares (by value) of contracts going to male-headed firms and female-headed firms.

## 8 Gender-Inequality Reduction Rate

The share of each ministry's expenditure that is allocated to assist in the reduction of gender inequality. This would be accompanied by quantitative indicators of the expected reduction in gender inequality, and an explanation of how the reduction is expected to be achieved.

Note, the emphasis here is on sectoral (or meso level) effects. To take account of the full impact of the overall budget requires the development of a gender-aware macroeconomic scenario or model that will analyse employment, growth, and inflation from a gender perspective.

All of the gender relevant disaggregations can be further disaggregated along lines of class, race and region.

## Examples of Use

While no government at the moment produces a budget statement containing the above list of gender-relevant disaggregations, there are some relevant experiences and ideas on which to draw.

Women's Budget Statement initiated by the Australian government in 1984.

- For evaluations of this experience see Rhonda Sharp and Ray Broomhill "Women and Government Budgets", *Australian Journal of Social Issues*, Vol. 25. No 1. 1990.

World Summit for Social Development 20/20 Initiative. This was the recommendation that government spend 20 % of their budgets on basic social services, and donors do the same for their aid budgets.

- For an empirical investigation of the possibilities for implementation see Santosh Mehrotra and Aung Tun Thet, "Public Expenditure on Basic Social Services: The Scope for Budget Restructuring in Selected Asian and African Economies", *UNICEF Staff Working Paper*, No. 14. New York, 1996.

Sri Lanka Budget in Brief. The Ministry of Finance and Planning produces a short presentation of the information contained in the Annual Estimates approved by Parliament, using simple tables, graphs and charts.

## Institutional Stakeholders

A Gender-Aware Budget Statement can only be produced by the Ministry of Finance, in co-operation with all the government ministries.

Other stakeholders may also have roles to play. For instance, in the absence of an official Gender-Aware Budget Statement, it may still be possible for independent research institutes or NGOs to calculate some of the gender-relevant disaggregations on the basis of information contained in the budget estimates. These organisations may also play a role in monitoring the extent to which outcomes are in line with budget estimates; and in comparing and commenting upon changes over time in gender-relevant disaggregations of expenditure and outcomes.

## Implementation

Establish how the budget is currently prepared and presented.

Identify how far the required information for the gender-disaggregations is currently available. Note that in identifying women's priority services and transfers, use may be made of gender-disaggregated beneficiary assessments, gender-disaggregated public expenditure benefit incidence analysis, and gender-aware policy evaluation of public expenditure by sector. The latter will also be vital for preparation for calculating a gender-inequality reduction ratio.

Secure agreement on which gender-relevant expenditure disaggregations will be presented in the next budget, and establish procedures for the collection of the relevant information and production of the relevant calculations.

Ensure wide distribution of the Gender Aware Budget Statement and encourage public debate about its implications.

Set up procedures to monitor how far outcomes matched projections and to review procedures so as to reduce discrepancies.

## Gender-Disaggregated Analysis of Impact of Budget on Time Use

### Aim

To identify relationships between the national budget and household time budgets, so as to reveal the macroeconomic implications of unpaid work in social reproduction. That is, the time devoted to caring for the family and community members, to the sick; to collecting fuel and water; to cooking, cleaning and teaching children and so on.

### Instruments

The collection of information on how household members utilise their time through household surveys.

Time-use data, disaggregated by gender (and age), can then be used to reveal connections between the government's budget and household time budgets. For example:

- i Calculation of the "reproduction tax" defined as the proportion of a person's time spent on unpaid reproductive work in order to maintain society. Changes in reproduction tax can then be linked to changes in other taxes.
- ii Calculation of a social sector's input-output matrix that includes unpaid caring work as an input and output, as well as social sector public expenditure.
- iii Calculation of household expenditure of time and money on services including health, education, sanitation, transport. Changes in time expenditures can then be linked to changes in public expenditure.

By pricing unpaid work a "satellite account" can be constructed for the whole country to calculate gross household product. This will enable policy-makers to establish a link between changes in gross household product and gross national product.

### Examples of Use

Some governments already collect time-use data and use it as the basis for constructing satellite accounts and analysing policy issues.

Canada has published regular estimates of monetary value of unpaid work since 1978. Time-use surveys were initiated in 1986. Statistics Canada estimates that in 1992 unpaid work had a monetary value equivalent to 30-46 per cent of GDP. Status of Women Canada has put forward a six-point policy framework for addressing unpaid work

- See, Zcyncp Karman, "Toward a Framework for Evaluating the Policy Implications of Unpaid Work," Status of Women Canada, 1995.

Norway estimates unpaid household work since 1912. Current Statistics Norway conducts regular national time budget surveys and estimated in 1990 that the monetary value of unpaid house work was just under 40 per cent of GDP.

Netherlands established an Expert Committee to determine how to redistribute unpaid work between men and women. The Committee analysed time-use data and recommended changes in tax and expenditure policies and employment laws.

- See, Marga Bruyn-Hundt, "Scenarios for a Redistribution of Unpaid Work in the Netherlands", *Feminist Economics*, Vol. 2, No. 3, 1996.

World Bank uses social input-output analysis and household social accounts in social sector analysis. This analysis could be extended to incorporate unpaid household production of social services, applying techniques used by researchers in Australia, Canada and Norway.

- World Bank, "*Morocco Reaching the Disadvantaged: Social Expenditure Priorities in the 1990s*," (Report No. 7903 – MOR), World Bank, Washington DC, 1990.
- Lionel Demery, Shiyun Chao, Rene Bernier, and Kalpana Mehra, "The Incidence of Social Spending in Ghana", *PSP Discussion Paper Series No. 82*, Poverty and Social Policy Department, World Bank, Washington DC, 1995.
- Duncan Ironmonger, "Counting Outputs, Capital Inputs and Caring Labour: Estimating Gross Household Product", *Feminist Economics*, Vol. 2, No. 3, 1996.

## Institutional Stakeholders

### 1 Who can use these instruments?

Social sector ministries can use this data to analyse the impact of their policies on household use of time to produce social services.

Ministry of Finance can analyse implications of the budget for the satellite account for the unpaid economy as well as for the conventional national accounts for the paid economy.

Independent research institutes can use data on time use and public expenditure to analyse the implications of the budget for unpaid work.

### 2 Who can develop these instruments?

The Central Statistical Office is the key stakeholder, since it alone has the capacity to conduct regular, comprehensive time-use surveys and construct satellite accounts.

NGOs can contribute to production of time-use data by selective monitoring of sentinel sites using the techniques of Mass Observation (such as daily diaries).

## Implementation

Identify data available on time-use for the country concerned. If necessary initiate a regular collection of time-use data.

Develop awareness of how such data can be used in policy analysis.

Encourage relevant ministries to publish an analysis of the implications of their expenditure policies for household time budgets.

Publicise data on time-use and unpaid household production.

Facilitate public discussion of the implications of this information for policy.

Review policy and consider what changes are appropriate.

## Gender-Aware Medium Term Macroeconomic Policy Framework

### Aim

To create a medium term macroeconomic policy framework incorporating differentiated roles of men and women in economic activity.

### Instruments

Medium term macroeconomic policy frameworks are formulated with the help of a variety of economy-wide models, for example, i) financial programming models; ii) fixed coefficient, two-gap, growth accounting models; iii) macroeconometric models; and iv) computable general equilibrium models.

Currently all of these instruments exclude a gender perspective. A variety of approaches could be used to introduce gender concerns:

- 1 Disaggregate existing variables in the models on the basis of gender where applicable.
- 2 Introduce new variables and equations to incorporate a gender perspective.
- 3 Construct new models incorporating the conventional macroeconomic system (based on the national income accounts) and a gender relations system (based on household income accounts of unpaid work).
- 4 Change the assumptions of the available models regarding social-institutional set up to incorporate a gender perspective. A major focus of economic reforms is changing these institutions but the analysis of institutions and design of reforms currently overlooks the gender dimension.

A variety of approaches could be used to analyse economies as gendered institutions:

- i identification of gender balance in decision-making on macroeconomic policy
- ii identification of gender composition of organisations and fora in which macroeconomic policy is debated
- iii identification of gender content of organisational culture in the key sectors of the economy e.g. patterns of time use, selection of performance indicators, structure of incentive systems, profiling of occupations, gender composition of employment
- iv identification of gender roles in the process of macroeconomic adjustment e.g. if aggregate monetary demand exceeds supply, whose consumption of marketed goods is cut? What role does women's unpaid work play in the adjustment process?

### Examples in use

Macroeconomic models are currently used to generate medium term economic forecasts by international institutions, Ministries of Finance, Development Banks and other national institutions, and independent research groups. For example:

- International Monetary Fund, "Theoretical Aspects of the Design of Fund Supported Adjustment Programmes", *Occasional Paper No. 55*, Washington DC, 1987.

- D. Addison, "The World Bank Revised Minimum Standard Model – Concepts and Issues," Policy and Planning and Research Paper WPS 231, World Bank Washington DC, 1989.
- W. Naude and P. Brixen, "A Provisional CGE Model for South Africa Based on the 1988 SAM," *South African Journal of Economic and Management Sciences*, Vol. 10, pp 22-33, 1992.

Strategies for introducing gender into macroeconomic models are now being explored by researchers:

- N. Cagatay, D. Elson and C. Grown (eds), *Gender, Adjustment and Macroeconomics – Special Issue*, *World Development*, Vol. 23, No. 11, 1995.
- Duncan Ironmonger, "Modelling the Household Economy" in Jan Dutta (ed) *Economics, Econometrics and the LINK: Essays in Honour of Lawrence R. Klein*, North Holland, Amsterdam, 1995.

The institutional context of macroeconomics is analysed in a series of studies by the World Institute for Development Economics Research, United Nations University, Helsinki:

- Lance Taylor, *Varieties of Stabilization Experience: Towards Sensible Macroeconomics in the Third World*, Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1988.

Strategies for analysing economics as gendered institutions are now being explored by researchers:

- Diane Elson, Barbara Evers and Jasmine Gideon, *Gender Aware Country Economic Reports – Concepts and Sources*, *Working Paper No. 1*, GENECON unit, Graduate School of Social Sciences, University of Manchester, 1997.

Further development is required to produce gender-aware models and institutional analysis capable of producing a gender-aware medium term macroeconomic policy analysis.

## Implementation

Organise symposia on the macroeconomic models currently used by the country to integrate gender into them.

Set up a working group of economists and gender analysts to produce a report on ways to integrate gender into the country's medium term economic policy framework.

Organise workshops to consider ways in which women can play a greater role in macroeconomic policy making.

Initiate discussions with the World Bank on how to improve the treatment of gender in Country Assistance Strategy Documents.