Chapter 5

From Findings to Policy and Practice

The findings from interviews and group discussions lead, perhaps counter-intuitively, in two directions. First, the issues that affect refugee teachers are often banal and also affect national teachers or other refugee professionals. Refugees are usually *more* affected, rather than differently affected, particularly if they are qualified already.

Second, looking at the four countries (if we include South Sudan, not in the original remit) it is clear that there are few measures that would work everywhere. Disappointingly some 'universal' measures, such as trying to set up a system of certification, have been tried over the last 20 years and have had only limited success.

5.1 Government

5.1.1 Government policies, national and local

Governments have policies on refugees and have generally acceded to the various conventions governing the status and rights of refugees. The authors have noted already that the ministries dealing with refugees do not automatically liaise with the ministries of education or local education departments. For example, the Ugandan MoES has no specific mandate or policy regarding refugee teachers. Generally, refugees seeking employment in public schools have to join the same recruitment process as nationals, usually through some form of teachers' (or education) service commission.

There is no institutional preference for refugee teachers – and it would be politically difficult to justify employing refugee teachers when national teachers are unemployed, unless they were qualified in shortage areas.

Recommendation 4: Governments should ensure that official policy is clearly explained (to their own people, as well as to refugees). This includes the law, and the rights and obligations of refugees. Where necessary, such explanations should be targeted at specific issues causing xenophobia or misunderstandings. This information is best provided in a simple brochure, in radio spots and professionally produced publicity, similar to the professionalism of HIV/AIDS campaigns, emphasising the humanity of refugees and promoting a 'welcome' from the host community. Incorporation of refugees into popular soap operas could be a way to start. Organisations with credible histories of combating racism, xenophobia and discrimination are present in most countries hosting refugees. They can be selectively invited to contribute to creating a climate of respect for refugee rights.

The study found evidence that refugee teachers do face constraints in finding secure, equally remunerated teaching work, constraints national teachers do not necessarily face.

5.1.2 Divergence between policy and practice

Official policies often differ from actual practice, and this can be both a hindering and facilitating phenomenon. In some cases, this blocks employment or frustrates the teacher. In others it allows for niches where they can work, although not always as a teacher. In South Africa, there are significant disparities between official national policy and provincial and local practice. For instance, it was found that provincial schools sometimes *go against* national policies in not allowing qualified refugee teachers to teach – even though they are legally entitled to do so.

Teachers are not the only professionals among refugees, and a government may see no reason to have a separate policy for them. Advocacy groups should lobby for consistency at least in policy on implementing the right to work, with an emphasis on teachers regarding advocacy with ministries of education. As noted elsewhere, teachers will have to play their own role in this by organising themselves and addressing specific concerns, by perhaps approaching the unions for help.

5.2 Refugee teachers

5.2.1 Scarcity of qualified teachers in refugee populations

It is often found that there are few teachers among migrant populations (Sesnan 2009). This has been noted in Malawi (Mozambicans), in Uganda (Sudanese and Rwandese) and in Chad (Sudanese refugees from Darfur). The same observation applies to populations isolated in civil wars (stayees) and in urban slum areas. Along with other salaried people, they may not have left with the rest, preferring to stay at home or move somewhere else in the home country. Often this is because they want to retain their jobs and salaries.

> **Recommendation 5**: Educational management information systems (EMIS) are needed to register teachers who are refugees as well as refugees who *become* teachers. While development partners such as UNESCO-IIEP and IICBA may support the development of such an EMIS, local ownership, ongoing management and support from UNHCR, NGOs and bodies that register refugees will be needed.

5.2.2 Teacher supply and demand

The market for refugee teachers is not what the economists would call a 'free market' since although there may be a willing seller (the refugee teacher), there is rarely a willing buyer. The refugee teacher is at disadvantage at almost every step in the process. Nonetheless, a supply and demand description does help to understand the situation

of refugee teachers. In many African host countries, there are large numbers of trained national teachers who are unemployed because of government budget constraints. In Uganda, for instance, there are already too many qualified Ugandan teachers in relation to budgeted openings. Refugees must have the same qualifications, or fit into poorly paid niches in private schools or take on private tuition. In Kenya, outside the camps it is the same situation.

However, South Africa has had a different experience. Many national teachers started leaving the profession in the early part of the last decade. There were genuine opportunities for qualified teachers from neighbouring countries, who were not at first considered as refugees (and in the case of, say, Botswana, are still not considered refugees).

The existence of unemployed teachers in a region with a net shortage of teachers in the classroom raises questions about the efficiency of teacher deployment. The African Union is currently developing a continental teacher recruitment protocol, along with supporting mechanisms for improving the management of internationally recruited migrant teachers. The protocol will encourage the mobility of teachers, promoting the orderly deployment of teachers from areas of teacher surplus to areas of deficit.

Integrating refugee teachers into this emerging framework could be beneficial. It is more cost effective to redeploy trained teachers than train new ones. Facilitating the voluntary movement of teachers to where they are needed might reduce some of the negative consequences of being a refugee, though it is difficult to envisage how this could be handled given that it would have to apply to all professionals among refugees.

5.2.3 Sponsorships and scholarships

Sponsors have helped some refugees to gain qualifications. There is some sporadic evidence of this (notably the work of RET, JRS, Windle Trust and World University Service Canada through the then Education Programme for Sudanese Refugees [EPSR]). One of the refugee informants for this study received support from the South African National Zakat Foundation. He mentioned that JRS also provides scholarships for teachers, though this does not seem to be on a regular basis. The provision of individual scholarships is not common practice in Kenya, though each year some refugee teachers do get a chance for advancement through partnerships between NGOs, UNHCR and certain universities.

In Uganda sponsorship was used in the past on a collective basis to allow groups, particularly of women, to receive training. The Albert Einstein German Academic Refugee Initiative (also known as the 'DAFI programme') is managed in different ways in each country, and has provided some opportunities for higher training.[1]

5.2.4 Attrition among refugee teachers

In Uganda it was observed that even trained teachers leave teaching at a fairly high rate. There is thus a continual need for recruiting/training new refugee teachers. In camps, refugee teachers (especially those that are well-educated and female) are often quickly employed by NGOs/UN agencies for other kinds of work. Refugee teachers

simply take more remunerative work outside their profession, almost always in the private sector.

5.2.5 Motivation/desire to be a teacher

This leads to the important issue of *motivation*. It is difficult to analyse how many of the refugee teachers the authors met actually *wanted* to be teachers, rather than taking the post because nothing better was available. The latter option is common across Africa, and not only among refugees. On the other hand, in Dadaab some years ago it was noted that Congolese teachers worked hard and well, and produced good results both in education and in the examinations.[2] Indeed, some few refugee learners also often excel in exile, having high motivation and fewer distractions.

5.2.6 The legal and professional status of refugee teachers

Among the challenges facing refugee teachers is the absence of institutional frameworks, such as published information or recruitment organisations to guide them in finding jobs. Often host countries fail to recognise refugee teachers' qualifications and bodies such as teacher service commissions and teacher unions might not readily provide professional guidance and support. In many cases, refugee teachers will end up doing work other than teaching in the host country. When seeking work in the host country, many refugee teachers accept jobs that do not utilise their professional skills, as, for example, car park attendants or maids.

Technically, refugee teachers in Uganda and South Africa are entitled to work, and there are no legal obstacles to their doing so after being officially recognised as refugees or asylum-seekers. However, there are administrative hurdles to be overcome, not least the need to be qualified according to local laws.

The authors found a common misunderstanding among refugee teachers that the authorities would proactively welcome them, or search for them and ease their way. It is clear that because of lack of information and support in finding employment, teachers themselves have to take most of the responsibility to find a job.

Recommendation 6: The emerging teacher recruitment protocol for Africa, which at the time of writing is being developed by the African Union, should specifically address the issue of refugee teachers. Governments should liaise with neighbouring countries and, if it does not exist already, establish a system for mutual recognition of qualifications. Institutions should be encouraged to place results (and the meaning of grades) on public access websites. This should be developed alongside other similar mechanisms such as, for example, the Virtual University for Small States of the Commonwealth's Transnational Qualification Framework, to ensure wider international comparability. The South–South co-operation aspects of liaising among developing countries to support mutual recognition of qualifications could be supported by the UNDP Special Unit for South–South Co-operation.[3]

5.2.7 The main obstacles to becoming a teacher in a host country

In host countries like Kenya, which has a pool of 40,000 unemployed (but trained) teachers, it is difficult to recommend that refugee teachers be hired, even though there is a teacher shortage at school level. An exception may be where the refugees are found in remote, sparsely populated regions where it might be difficult to find or attract local teachers. However, this was not the case in the countries studied.

Several challenges make it difficult for teachers to have their qualifications recognised in other countries. First of all, there is an absence of agreed international standards for the contents and scope of teacher training or for related professional standards, though there are often bilateral or ad hoc arrangements. Even in situations where teachers' qualifications might be recognised, they may not have the relevant paperwork in their possession at the time of departure from the home country during an emergency. National authorities seldom accept teaching certificates given by NGOs or other non-formal providers. To address this issue, the Commonwealth Secretariat, with the South African Qualification Authority, has developed tools on the recognition of teacher qualifications and professional registration status across Commonwealth member states (Keevy and Jansen 2010). However, these tools do not cover non-Commonwealth countries; nor do they take into account the particular circumstances of education in emergencies (Penson et al. 2012). It is clear that NGOs which recruit teachers in emergencies should work together to harmonise their teacher training programmes. Teacher training programmes should aim for official recognition. If they do not already exist, governments should establish an accreditation mechanism for teacher training programmes delivered by non-state providers, and provide clear information on the standards expected and the accreditation process.

5.3 The management of refugee teachers in host countries

The management of refugees in a specific country may be multi-layered and it was noted that, in all three countries studied, the ministries of education are not involved in the management of refugee teachers as a distinct category. Typically, governments treat a refugee like any other foreigner when it comes to employment. This fact complicates any intent to lobby for the protection of the rights of refugee teachers specifically.

The reduction of UNHCR's activities to camp management and protection, and the subsequent handing over of education to NGOs or government, has been in place for around 20 years. Education in most camps is monitored by a UNHCR protection officer or a community services officer, but very rarely an education officer, although UNHCR has proposed a welcome renewed role for itself in education in its latest education strategy (UNHCR 2012).

Recommendation 7: The lead ministry for refugees and the ministry of education should each designate a person or unit to work with the other on the matter of refugee teachers. Action relating to this recommendation is of primary concern to governments. However, INEE members and the

Commonwealth Secretariat can provide technical assistance. UNICEF and UNESCO-IIEP could assist ministries of education whose capacities these agencies have developed in managing education in emergencies to co-ordinate with ministries that handle refugee affairs.

5.3.1 Preparedness for an emergency provoking a refugee influx

Adapting educational planning and management to anticipate and mitigate emergencies is in its infancy in most African countries. By and large, host countries cope with growing refugee populations on an ad hoc basis.

Although preparedness is clearly vital, preparation for an emergency does not seem to figure highly in many governments' policies. 'As a result of this lack of political attention, the budget for emergency planning is often neglected and funds are not earmarked for these activities' (IIEP 2010b: 22). Further, 'The vagaries of annual budgeting compound the problems of education financing during emergencies. This is especially true in situations of long-term displacement' (UNESCO 2011: 19), where budgeting for long-term refugee needs is made difficult by changing political and donor priorities. There remains much advocacy work to be done to increase the understanding of refugees' needs in an emergency, and of developing proactive institutional frameworks for managing them in the event of an emergency.

Recommendation 8: In emergency and early reconstruction, teachers who have not completed official certification processes but who possess 'alternative qualifications' could be temporarily recognised. To enable this, tools such as rapid assessment tests of teaching skills and instruction in emergency situations are needed.

5.4 Getting trained, qualified and certified

It is possible for a refugee to be trained as a teacher in the host country and there are many examples of this, especially in East Africa. The examples range from refugees who take up a full course of training (and in extreme cases actually catch up on their secondary schooling before doing so or, as in Chad, simultaneously) to those who are employed without training, in camps or private schools, but are given a series of short courses. Such courses are rarely integrated with others and are of limited use when they go home, as they tend to be uncertified by any recognised institution. The amount of time spent on these short courses and their frequent duplication is an issue that is rarely addressed yet they have an impact on teaching time. Switches in the NGOs delivering services can mean that training previously provided is repeated unnecessarily. The per diems offered for training mean that it is often taken up even when its utility is questionable.

In some places, there is a modular in-service course leading to a fully recognised qualification. Some examples are given below. In South Sudan's liberated areas during the war, such a modular in-service course existed. Following it, in theory, after three years of self-study and vacation courses, a primary teacher could accumulate sufficient modules to be given a certificate. However, this did not often happen in practice, as NGOs lost funds or their priorities changed, and teachers moved on to other places or other jobs.

In South Sudan this course has been replaced by a detailed 'Unified Curriculum', but in the camps, first in Uganda and then in Kenya, the pragmatic trend has been to link into existing good-quality professional courses. In some cases these are specially designed for the refugees' situation, as in the case of Kyambogo University (then the Institute of Teacher Education), which revived a moribund qualification[4] and revised it to suit the needs of South Sudanese refugees.

Two particularly interesting cases were found in Uganda in the 1990s: in one instance JRS sponsored 30 young female South Sudanese a year to be trained as teachers in Christ the King Teacher Training College, Gulu; and in the other instance, serving teachers in the camps were linked into the national Northern Integrated Teacher Education Programme through the EPSR's Alere Resource Centre.

5.4.1 Short courses

Short (in some cases very short) courses for refugees in camps are common. Examples are given in Mohammed's case study (Box 4.1). These courses tempt us to ask: *How many short courses make a certificate?* The answer is usually that they are of little value, not least because 'attendance certificates' and the like are generally uninformative and because they do not fit into an overall schema. National systems do not easily recognise these modular or 'bitty' courses, and sometimes on the return home the refugees find the courses have no value at all, in terms of their contributing towards a recognised qualification.

Note was taken of how distance and open programmes are evolving. Radio has often been useful in reinforcing teachers' self-help efforts and, gradually, online courses, e-books/tablets and mobile phones will play a role, although it is doubtful that they can fully replace the classic self-study manual with occasional face-to-face encounters with a tutor.

5.4.2 Missing qualifications

A refugee may have been a teacher in his or her home country, but has migrated without documentation. In this case a competency test should be provided, preferably by a recognised host-country institution. This, it should be noted, is less of a problem these days than before, because of much improved communications and the existence of many databases online.

5.4.3 More advanced courses

An example of a more advanced course for an already trained teacher is the South African Advanced Certificate in Education, which 'enables students to become greater

specialists in their subjects or to be retrained in a new specialisation within a relatively short period of time' (University of South Africa 2011). Similarly, in Uganda there is a recognised ladder for teachers leading to degree level, in the form of a two-year Bachelor of Education from Kyambogo University. Refugees have access to this ladder if they can find sponsors. The case study of Christopher (Box 4.6) illustrates this.

Recommendation 9: Refugee teacher training should for the most part be provided by a certificate- or diploma-issuing body recognised in both the host and home countries. Home countries should ensure that their administration is aware of any such agreements and the validity of qualifications. UNHCR and the NGOs that provide teacher training would benefit from technical guidance from UNESCO-IICBA and IIEP in developing teacher certification programmes. UNESCO and, among other partners, the UK Open University and the Commonwealth of Learning, can offer technical guidance on distance and open learning for refugee teachers. USAID also has a great deal of experience in distance learning for teachers in developing countries.

5.4.4 Learning management and school governance

There are courses that promote capacity building for teachers to participate in and develop skills in leadership, financial management and democratic decision-making. An example of this is Section D of the *Be a Better Teacher* course (see section 5.5.2).

5.5 Being specifically trained to teach in emergencies

The unpredictable nature of emergencies makes it difficult to provide advance training for all teachers. In some cases, a course is provided rapidly while the emergency is under way or when it has settled down. It will usually include (as related by a reviewer of this study): *sensitivity to the psychosocial needs of (conflict and disaster affected) children and youth; adaptation to the reality on the ground.*

What follows are some examples that address the issue of helping the untrained teacher to become *competent*, *knowledgeable* and *confident*.

5.5.1 Teacher Assistance course (a rapid methodology course)

In an urgent situation where thousands of displaced people were arriving in Khartoum from the South of Sudan and Darfur in the 1980s, SOLO (Sudan Open Learning Organization) in Khartoum developed a self-help course for the large number of 'volunteer' untrained teachers called the Teacher Assistance course. This course comprised 30 short modules on specific and practical themes (*How to Use the Blackboard* and *Handling Large Classes* were examples), which were to be studied alone in the teacher's tent or shack and in small groups with an experienced teacher, wherever one could be found.

No effort was made to include more than the simplest educational theory or pedagogy, the urgent need being seen to help the teacher become competent and confident in front of the class. This training, like most similar trainings, had no legal or academic recognition, although several years later it was incorporated into a wider training for the displaced. It is important to recall that such short trainings are often given only to help the teacher function for the expected limited period of the emergency, and are often *not designed* to become official qualifications.

5.5.2 *Be a Better Teacher/Bon enseignant*

In Somalia, where the state education system had largely collapsed since 1989, the UNESCO Programme of Education for Emergencies and Reconstruction (PEER) first worked on primary education. Eventually, building on SOLO's work in Sudan, a UNESCO-PEER team in Somaliland developed a much more substantial self-help, 40-module course called *Be a Better Teacher,* which established the now common pattern of three, ten-module courses for ordinary teachers (A, B, C) and one extra course (D) for school administrators and inspectors. A ten-module course typically lasted one term. This has been replaced now in Somalia by various forms of the Strengthening the Capacity of Teacher Training programme (SCOTT, see Box 5.1).

The training was adapted for francophone contexts as *Bon enseignant*.

Box 5.1 Strengthening the Capacity of Teacher Training programme (SCOTT)

SCOTT produces primary and secondary teachers who are recognised by the Somaliland and Puntland governments, so although it is managed by NGOs and mostly implemented by the private sector, it is integrated into the official system. Perhaps this is the learning that could be applied generally – i.e. greater co-ordination among agencies to ensure an integrated approach, rather than the piecemeal approach described above. Two weakness of SCOTT are that it is an 'emergency' design that is trying to be extended into a non-emergency context and that NGOs, as direct recipients of the donor funding, have a great deal of control.

5.5.3 Conversion courses

Occasionally a teacher who is already qualified needs a conversion course, most commonly to enable them to use a new language or a new syllabus. The case study of Timothy (Box 4.4) demonstrates the utility of such courses.

5.6 Financial considerations

It was clear that there was major drop-out of teachers, whether they were qualified or not, into more lucrative work (Zimbabweans in South Africa, Somalis in camps,

South Sudanese at home). The authors examined the issue of how much teachers were paid in a variety of circumstances.

5.6.1 Pay and remuneration

Both the UNESCO International Institute for Education Planning (IIEP) *Guidebook for Planning Education in Emergencies and Reconstruction* (IIEP 2010a) and INEE *Guidance Notes on Teacher Compensation in Fragile States, Situations of Displacement and Post-crisis Recovery* (INEE 2009) contain advice on compensating teachers, particularly in camp settings.

5.6.2 Low levels of payment in camps

Refugees are often paid on a fixed low scale[5] which applies to all sectors and is substantially less than they would have earned either at home or if paid on the host country scale. The word 'salary' is avoided and replaced with a word like 'allowance' or 'incentive'. Contracts are not given and ordinary employment rights are not available. There is a fear of commitment in what may turn out to be a short-term emergency. In many African countries employing someone for a year gives them rights which organisations are reluctant to accord to refugees.

UNHCR, which often controls the salary grille (since they finance most of the NGO partners), argues that refugees get free 'housing', free food, free medical care and free education for their children. This can set a precedent for other donors.

Further, the host government may have expressly, as in Kenya, forbidden refugees to be employed without almost-impossible-to-obtain work permits. The use of the term 'salary' or 'contract' is avoided to remain under the radar, yet this raises questions about labour rights which are rarely addressed.

The arrival of modern communications has clearly, perhaps for the first time, reminded us that refugees have families and obligations at home and abroad. Donors and other partners were alleged to have yet to adapt to this reality. A recent case in eastern Chad, where an international NGO employing refugees used Chadian law to argue that refugees should have contracts, is also significant. It was established *prima facie* that the case of an 'employee' being a refugee did not mean that the 'employer' was allowed to avoid providing contracts or paying salaries and giving mandated benefits.

Teachers eventually want to 'go where the money is'. The authors are convinced that if realistic salaries were paid in the short term, teachers who left the profession might come back.

5.6.3 The ladder

Manik (2011) notes that Zimbabwean refugee teachers working in South Africa found it difficult to access opportunities for promotion or professional development, mainly because they were on temporary contracts and therefore ineligible. In long-standing refugee situations, teachers want an explicit link between training, length of service and promotion. This would be normal in the teaching service, as has been reported

Table 5.1 Remuneration: Monthly salaries for teachers (excluding benefits packages)*

	Government (USD)	Camp (NGO paying 'incentive teacher'**) (USD)
Kenya primary	$150	$90
South Africa primary	$1,300	NA
Uganda primary	$110	Around 20% less***

* It is not simply a matter of salary; a teacher who is 'established' in the system has many benefits and entitlements, including a rank (seniority) and a pension. Refugee teachers may have reluctantly left those at home and are highly unlikely to obtain them in exile.

** The term 'incentive teacher' is used to refer to those refugees on an allowance, not a salary. This allowance in Dadaab, for instance, is less than 20 per cent of the government salary.

*** In Uganda, teachers employed by NGOs complain that social security and similar deductions are made, though they will never benefit from them.

from the early days of expansion of the Zimbabwean education system and from the trade union-led push for self-improvement in Tanzania some years ago.

However, this leads to the question of whether a refugee teacher sees a future within the system and is willing to stay on the ladder. This is not always the case.

Recommendation 10: It should be recognised that refugee teachers increasingly find their own place in the employment market. Agencies and NGOs can help, however, by paying competitive salaries and providing promotion opportunities in the camps or wherever they employ teachers. They should not rely on a principle of volunteerism for more than the first few months of a refugee crisis, nor work to keep salaries artificially low in relation to the wider employment market. UNHCR and NGOs in charge of training and supervising camp teachers could help facilitate the eventual integration of trained teachers into the education systems of their host or home countries.

5.7 Sensitising the host country

In an atmosphere of mass unemployment and xenophobia, it is important to work on encouraging the host community to accept and help refugees. The authors note that some refugee teachers are welcomed by students, parents and the local education authority, but our study shows that this is generally the exception not the rule. There was little evidence that a refugee was seen as 'value-added', and whereas individuals often welcomed individuals there was no general policy on accepting them.

In South Africa, Khan has proposed working to create a 'welcoming society' for the *kwerekwere*[6] saying that:

> 'It has been our experience then when the South African community understood the reasons why refugees were forced to flee and why refugee protection is a moral

> and legal obligation, [there is] a significant change in attitude. This was done by having *information campaigns* – within the communities where refugees find themselves… We now know that information is not enough. We also need to create empathy – this can be facilitated by having refugees to tell their stories.' (Khan 2007: 8)

She further notes that 'A way of creating a welcoming society is to ensure balanced public information on refugee issues. To achieve this we engage the media. This is also one way of tackling xenophobia' (2007: 8), and that 'The South African government has done very little to educate South Africans about refugee documents' (2007: 5).

One refugee told us: 'I honestly think that the South African community in its majority has not yet understood why refugees are in their midst. Public servants and/or government officials are mostly the ones who make it difficult for refugees'.

5.7.1 Promoting knowledge about refugees and refugee rights

An example of an indirect barrier to work is the difficulty refugees have in accessing public services, particularly primary school education for their children. South African law, for example, is quite clear and in conformity with the various conventions: that public schools must admit learners and serve their educational requirements without unfairly discriminating in any way. Refugee children are entitled to the same primary education as South African children (Republic of South Africa 1998). Despite these rights, refugees often face obstacles accessing education for their children – for example, they are often requested to pay school fees (where they would otherwise qualify for school fee exemptions).

Recommendation 11: Because of informal or bureaucratic barriers to work, refugee teachers in South Africa should co-operate among themselves to create organisations to play a leadership role in opening closed doors. They must not rely only on their rights as refugees, but also come up with different skills and competences in order to create opportunities for themselves. Teacher unions or NGOs could serve as advocates as well as intermediaries between refugee teachers, SACE, SAQA, UNHCR and the government at different levels. Education International, of which the South African teacher unions are members, could also play an advocacy role.

5.7.2 Refugee teachers as an asset

Although the atmosphere is not always conducive, there are cases where having a source of refugee teachers can be an advantage, if only on a personal basis, to give learners a wider experience or a better (or different) accent. Refugee-affected area policies take advantage of this situation, often to mutual benefit. For example, the policy in Northern Uganda that camp schools should keep 10 per cent of their places for children from host schools on the periphery of the camp, recognised the fact that

the camp schools were better endowed than the national ones (Sesnan et al. 1995). Similarly, in Eastern Chad parents often enrolled their children in Arabic-medium schools in the Sudanese refugee camps in order to benefit from the higher quality of Arabic taught there (Sesnan 2011).

Recommendation 12: Encourage a view of refugee teachers as an asset towards improvement of quality or towards achievement of EFA goals, particularly in refugee-affected areas of a country such as camps. In some cases, this may be a temporary measure. UNHCR, UNICEF and UNESCO-IIEP are well suited to promoting refugee teachers as a resource for achieving EFA goals.

5.8 Language

To teach the main curriculum in all the three countries studied requires good English. Refugees from non-English-speaking countries (principally in our study, Somalis and Congolese, with some Rwandese) generally recognise this and attend courses to improve their English. However, the quality of classes is variable, and in some cases they are taught by fellow refugees who do not have the requisite standard themselves.

In Uganda, the Refugee Law Project provides English for Adults to enable refugees to adapt to the system in Uganda, since most refugees come from non-English-speaking countries, e.g. Rwanda, Democratic Republic of Congo, Eritrea and Somalia. Such English courses do not have great value in themselves in enabling refugees to find teaching jobs. They are more useful in enabling them to take further courses (and to navigate bureaucracy).

In South Africa, Congolese refugees complained that the government had done little to help them in this regard, but from our observation it could also be argued that these refugees had not shown much commitment and enthusiasm in trying to improve on their communication skills. One South African private centre the authors encountered, which is trying to help refugees with some simple basic English skills, is poorly resourced, reliant on refugees to deliver lessons and unable to offer a high-quality of instruction.

Recommendation 13: UNHCR or service providers should provide intensive English (or other) language improvement where necessary to enable refugee teachers to compete in the host country. The UK Open University, Oxford University Press and the British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC)[7] are just a few UK and Commonwealth sources for distance learning of English. There are many others.

It is interesting that French-speakers occasionally get a chance to teach French, as Box 5.2 below shows.

Box 5.2 Case study of Bahati: An untrained Congolese refugee from DRC, who is teaching French in private institutions in Kampala, Uganda

'Being a teacher in Uganda was not a fluke. Since 2005, I am a refugee in this country and my profession keeps growing, not because of my own efforts but because the government policy on handling refugees enables me. For, under the Refugees Act 2006, recognised refugees enjoy the same right to work as nationals. Refugees do not require work permits in Uganda. OPM issues refugees with letters explaining their status and rights, including the right to work.

'For this reason, I found myself in the obligation to take this advantage and not shut myself up in a refugee settlement, this despite the fact that refugees in private schools do not enjoy the benefits of social security, unemployment or disability insurance, nor does labour legislation protect them.'

5.9 Returning home

Technically, refugees lose special protections afforded to their status by UNHCR and host governments once a conflict is declared 'over', at which time refugees are expected to return home. In reality, however, long-term refugees may have lost their homes, land and sources of livelihood in the home country. Returnees may find themselves blocked by bureaucracy and bureaucratic lack of knowledge about the tripartite agreement, as in Juba where the Windle Trust took up their cause and trained them to be temporary teachers and youth counsellors while they waited for admission to university.

An optimistic note is struck by RET. After years supporting refugee education in Tanzania (refugees from Burundi and DRC), RET accompanied the repatriation process of thousands of Burundian refugees to their home country. While supporting the integration of returnee youth into the Burundian Education system, the RET worked with former Burundian students who performed very well in English because of their long exile in Tanzania and they became English 'teacher's assistants' in Burundian secondary schools. The learning assets of returnee youth have been highly beneficial for Burundian students and help the returnees to reinforce their self-esteem and feel useful to their peers.

5.9.1 Recognising returnees' qualifications

The recognition of refugees' qualifications at home at the end of their period of exile is an important issue. Sudanese refugees in Chad would not take Chadian courses or examinations because they feared they would not be recognised at home. South Sudanese refugees in Uganda were, on the other hand, content to use Uganda's qualifications secure in the knowledge that those qualifications would (despite initial hiccups) be recognised in their new country.

5.9.2 Note on tripartite agreements

The importance of the tripartite agreement has to be mentioned. This agreement, signed when a refugee crisis is effectively over, is between UNHCR, the host government and the home government. It should contain clauses about automatic recognition of refugees' qualifications obtained while in exile. The relevant agreement for returning South Sudanese from Kenya (in January 2006) did not contain a clear reference to qualifications and was signed with the Sudanese government in Khartoum, whereas the returns were to an increasingly autonomous South Sudan, which had not been party to the agreement. Although such an agreement was also signed with Uganda in March 2006, the authors have not been able to access the details.

The 2006 *Tripartite Agreement between the Government of Kenya and the Government of the Republic of Sudan and the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees for the Voluntary Repatriation of Sudanese Refugees in Kenya to the Sudan* includes the following statement in Clause 8, Recognition of personal status and equivalency:

> **Clause 8: Recognition of personal status and equivalency**
>
> The legality of births, adoptions, marriage or divorces which will have taken place while the refugees were in Kenya shall be duly recognised by the Government of the Republic of Sudan upon the return of the refugee concerned. Academic qualification, vocational skills, diploma and certificates similarly obtained by them shall also be recognised, where applicable, in light of equivalent or comparable Sudanese qualifications.

Recommendation 14: Any tripartite agreement between the host country, the home country and UNHCR for the return of refugees should specify the validity and equivalence of qualifications. Work should be carried out to make sure that such an agreement's contents be sent to the correct receiving institutions in the home country. Returnees should receive transcripts or certificates before they return home, with comprehensive records placed on the worldwide web. The technical aspects of providing transcripts or certificates and creating the EMIS to record and update records could be supported by UNESCO.

5.9.3 Adapting the Commonwealth Teacher Recruitment Protocol (CTRP) to the needs of refugee teachers

The current study intends, inter alia, to provide initial recommendations and guidelines for developing policies on refugee teachers in Commonwealth host countries. The reason for this research is to propose complementary policy guidelines to the Commonwealth Teacher Recruitment Protocol (CTRP) of 2004, whose main purpose is to:

> '…balance the rights of teachers to migrate internationally, on a temporary or permanent basis, against the need to protect the integrity of national education

systems and to prevent the exploitation of scarce human resources of poor countries.' (Commonwealth Secretariat 2004, para. 2.3.1)

An important drawback of the CTRP is that its guidelines do not easily apply in situations of forced migration. Ochs's (2011) review of the implementation of the CTRP identifies significant lessons for optimising the management of voluntary teacher migration. Key recommendations include:

- preparation and planning;
- institutionalisation through policy and law; and
- data management.

The present report recommends that these same principles be applied to the management of refugee teachers.

Notes

1 See www.refed.org (accessed 2 August 2012).
2 Obura, personal communication.
3 The Special Unit seeks to support innovative/best practices in South–South co-operation.
4 To avoid having to create special legislation.
5 In Kenya around one-third of the official rate and without pension etc.
6 Common term used for refugees in South Africa.
7 See www.bbc.co.uk/learning (accessed 2 August 2012).

References

Commonwealth Secretariat (2004), *Commonwealth Teacher Recruitment Protocol*, Commonwealth Secretariat, London, available at: www.thecommonwealth.org/shared_asp_files/GFSR.asp?NodeID=39311 (accessed 18 July 2012).

INEE (2009), *INEE Guidance notes on teacher compensation in fragile states, situations of displacement and post-crisis recovery*, INEE, New York, available at: http://toolkit.ineesite.org/toolkit/INEEcms/uploads/1023/INEE_Guidance_Notes_Teacher_Compensation.pdf (accessed 22 May 2012).

International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP) (2010a), *Guidebook for Planning Education in Emergencies and Reconstruction Update*, UNESCO-IIEP, Paris, available at: www.iiep.unesco.org/fileadmin/user_upload/Cap_Dev_Technical_Assistance/pdf/Guidebook/Guideboook.pdf (accessed 14 June 2012).

IIEP (2010b), *Report on Online Discussion Forum on Planning and Preparedness for Education in Emergencies 14–25 June 2010*, UNESCO-IIEP, Paris, available at: http://oneresponse.info/GlobalClusters/Education/CapacityDevelopment/Documents/EiE%20Online%20forum%20Report_final.doc (accessed 14 June 2012).

Keevy, J and J Jansen (2010), *Fair Trade for Teachers: Transferability of Teacher Qualifications in the Commonwealth*, Commonwealth Secretariat, London.

Khan, F (2007), 'Local integration of urban refugees in South Africa – Lessons learnt and the way forward', paper drafted for discussion on UNHCR's 2007 Annual Consultations with NGOs, *Local integration: The preferred durable solution*, Geneva, Switzerland, 26 September 2007, University of Cape Town Law Clinic,

Cape Town, available at: www.refugeerights.uct.ac.za/downloads/refugeerights.uct.ac.za/local_intergration_sa_context.doc (accessed 24 May 2012).

Manik, S (2011), *Zimbabwean education professionals in South Africa: Motives for migration*, paper presented at the Sixth Commonwealth Research Symposium on Teacher Mobility, Recruitment and Migration, Addis Ababa, 9 June 2011, available at: www.eng.unesco-icba.org/sites/default/files/manik%20sadhana%20Zimbabwean%20education%20professionals.pdf (accessed March 2012).

Ochs, K (2011), *Revisiting the implementation of the Commonwealth Teacher Recruitment Protocol: furthering implementation and addressing critical steps in the recruitment process*, paper presented at the Sixth Commonwealth Research Symposium on Teacher Mobility, Recruitment and Migration, Addis Ababa, 9 June, 2011.

Penson, J, A Yonemura, B Sesnan, K Ochs and C Chanda (2012), 'Beyond the Commonwealth Teacher Recruitment Protocol: Next steps in managing teacher migration in education in emergencies', in Penson, J and A Yonemura (eds.), *Next Steps in Managing Teacher Migration Papers of the Sixth Commonwealth Research Symposium on Teacher Mobility, Recruitment and Migration*, Commonwealth Secretariat and UNESCO, London and Paris, available at: www.thecommonwealth.org/files/251175/FileName/NextStepsPapersebook.pdf (accessed 2 January 2013).

Republic of South Africa (1998), 'Refugees Act No. 130', *Government Gazette*, Vol. 402, No. 19544, 12 December 1998, Republic of South Africa, Cape Town, available at: www.home-affairs.gov.za/PDF/Acts/Refugees%20Act130.pdf (accessed 23 July, 2012).

Sesnan, B (2009), *Education in difficult circumstances*, Echo Bravo, Kampala and Oxford.

Sesnan, B (2011) *Finding people to teach and making them good teachers in a complex emergency: The case of Cote d'Ivoire from 2002*, UNESCO IICBA Newsletter Vol. 13, No. 1.

Sesnan, B, T Brown and M Kabba (1995), *Education in the refugee-affected area of Northern Uganda*, UNHCR, Kampala.

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) (2011), *The hidden crisis: Armed conflict and education*, Education for All Global Monitoring Report 2011, UNESCO, Paris, available at: http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0019/001907/190743e.pdf (accessed 14 June 2012).

UNHCR (2012), *Education strategy summary*, UNHCR, Geneva, available at: www.unhcr.org/4af7e71d9.html (accessed 18 July 2012).

University of South Africa (2011), 'Advanced Certificates in Education', available at: www.unisa.ac.za/Default.asp?Cmd=ViewContent&ContentID=5752 (accessed 18 July 2012).