

## Appendix 2

---

### Teacher Supply, Recruitment and Retention in Six Sub-Saharan Anglophone Countries: Report of a Study Conducted by Education International in The Gambia, Kenya, Lesotho, Tanzania, Uganda and Zambia

**Dennis Sinyolo**

#### Introduction

The achievement of the Education for All (EFA) targets and education-related Millennium Development Goals (MDGs)<sup>17</sup> depends, to a very large extent, on the availability of properly trained and qualified teachers. The educational quality imperative cannot be met without quality teachers—these are professionally trained teachers who understand both subject matter and teaching pedagogy.

There is overwhelming evidence that qualified teachers contribute to quality teaching and learning. The World Education Forum (2000) recognised the crucial role of trained teachers in the achievement of the EFA targets. One of the strategies adopted by the Forum to achieve the EFA goals, as given in The Dakar Framework (2000), was to ‘identify, train and retain good teachers ...’<sup>18</sup> In their joint publication on teachers, UNESCO and the OECD<sup>19</sup> (2001), argue that ‘a better trained teaching force is an important factor in educational quality’.<sup>20</sup> The two organisations further support the importance of professionally trained and qualified teachers by contending that ‘teachers’ subject matter expertise must be complemented by pedagogical competence’.<sup>21</sup> Even the World Bank Operations Evaluation Department (OED)

aptly acknowledges, in its 2004 Background Paper for the Evaluation of the Bank’s Support to Primary Education, ‘Many studies find that teacher training is important.’<sup>22</sup> The paper correctly observes that ‘better trained teachers are more effective in terms of cognitive achievement’.<sup>23</sup> Furthermore, many countries have invested tremendously in teacher education, both in pre-service and in-service training because they realise the enormous benefits of having professionally trained and qualified teachers. The above evidence clearly indicates that qualified teachers do matter. That is why proponents of the notion that anyone can teach would not allow their own children to be taught by unqualified teachers.

Unfortunately, some countries have turned a blind eye to the importance of qualified teachers and decided to employ unqualified, volunteer, contract or para-teachers. These teachers generally have very minimal or no teacher training at all, and are normally hired locally and paid by the community. The employment of unqualified, volunteer, contract or para-teachers is sometimes prescribed or done on the advice of international financial institutions such as the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Bank as a way of controlling or reducing education budgets and government expenditure.

---

17 Boxes 1 and 2 show the EFA and education-related MDGs.

18 *The Dakar Framework for Action*, Dakar, 2000, p. 20.

19 Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development.

20 *Teachers for Tomorrow’s Schools: Analysis of the World Education Indicators*, 2001, p. 7.

21 *Teachers for Tomorrow’s Schools: Analysis of the World Education Indicators*, 2001, p. 10.

22 *Determinants of Primary Education Outcomes in Developing Countries: Background Paper for the Evaluation of the World Bank’s Support to Primary education*, 2004, p. 22.

23 *Ibid.*

### Box 1: The Dakar EFA Goals

- 1 Expanding and improving comprehensive early childhood care and education, especially for the most vulnerable and disadvantaged children.
- 2 Ensuring that by 2015 all children, particularly girls, children in difficult circumstances and those belonging to ethnic minorities, have access to and complete free and compulsory primary education of good quality.
- 3 Ensuring that the learning needs of all young people and adults are met through equitable access to appropriated learning and life-skills programmes.
- 4 Achieving a 50 per cent improvement in levels of adult literacy by 2015, especially for women, and equitable access to basic and continuing education for all adults.
- 5 Eliminating gender disparities in primary education by 2005, and achieving gender equality in education by 2015, with a focus on ensuring girls' full and equal access to and achievement in basic education of good quality.
- 6 Improving all aspects of education and ensuring excellence of all so that learning outcomes are achieved by all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life-skills.

### Box 2: Education-related Millennium Development Goals

**Goal 2:** Achieve universal primary education. Target: Ensure that by 2015 children everywhere, boys and girls, will be able to complete a full course of good quality primary schooling.

**Goal 3:** Promote gender equality and empower women. Target: eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education, preferably by 2005, and at all levels of education no later than 2015.

Current global and regional teacher supply trends are not encouraging. According to the UIS Report (2006),<sup>24</sup> more than 18 million teachers would be needed (between 2004 and 2015) worldwide to meet the Universal Primary Education (UPE) goal. Sub-Saharan Africa alone would need close to 4 million primary school teachers to meet the same goal.

In view of the apparent insufficient supply of teachers and the prevalent employment of unqualified, volunteer, contract or para teachers in Sub-Saharan Africa, Education International decided to carry out a study focusing on five major teacher issues. The study, which was carried out between October 2006 and December 2007, focused on Teacher Supply, Teacher Attrition, Teacher Remuneration and Motivation, Teacher Absenteeism and Union Involvement in Policy Development. The study was carried out in six Anglophone sub-Saharan African countries. These are: The Gambia, Kenya, Lesotho, Tanzania, Uganda and Zambia.

24 UNESCO Institute of Statistics Publication, *Teachers and Educational Quality: Monitoring Global Needs for 2015*, 2006, p 100

## Objectives of the survey

The overall goal of the survey was to investigate various issues that affect the recruitment or supply and retention of qualified teachers in The Gambia, Kenya, Lesotho, Tanzania, Uganda and Zambia. The specific objectives of the survey were:

- 1 To identify the teacher supply needs of the participating countries;
- 2 To determine the existence (or non-existence) and prevalence (or non-prevalence) of unqualified, volunteer, contract or para-teachers in the Anglophone sub-Saharan African countries under investigation;
- 3 To solicit the stakeholders' views about the effectiveness of unqualified, volunteer, contract or para-teachers in facilitating quality teaching and learning;
- 4 To determine the extent of, and main causes of teacher attrition in the participating countries;
- 5 To find out if brain-drain was a major problem in the education sector in the countries under investigation, and if it was, what its main causes were;
- 6 To find out how the teachers' remuneration levels compared with those of the past and with those of their counterparts with similar and comparable qualifications and levels of training, both within, and outside the public service;
- 7 To find out how the remuneration levels of unqualified, volunteer, contract or para teachers compared with those of regular teachers;
- 8 To determine the teachers' general level of motivation in the participating countries;
- 9 To find out if teacher absenteeism was a major problem in the countries under investigation and, if it was, what its major causes were; and
- 10 To determine the extent to which teacher unions in the participating countries were involved in education policy development.

## Methodology

The study applied three main strategies for data collection. These were:

- 1 A desk study of each individual country's profile, education system, including education policies and primary indicators (GER, NER, adult literacy rate, transition rate, drop-out rate, school life expectancy, etc). Several official documents were analysed, including policy documents and education statistical bulletins.
- 2 A questionnaire, which was completed by unions and education authorities.
- 3 Country visits and meetings/discussions/interviews with various stakeholders-union leaders, ministry of education officials, teachers, UN agencies (UNESCO, UNICEF and the World Bank), EFA country coalitions and civil society organisations.

The various sources of information used in this survey ensured triangulation and improved the validity and reliability of the data and the study's findings.

However, it is important to note that educational statistics were not always readily available in a number of countries. Generally, most of the unions did not have basic educational statistics such as the total number of teachers in the country, the number of unqualified teachers etc.

## The demographic and educational contexts

As already stated, all the six countries included in this study are Anglophone sub-Saharan African countries. Three of them are from east Africa (Kenya, Uganda and Tanzania), two of them from Southern Africa (Lesotho and Zambia) and one of them is from west Africa (The Gambia). These countries constitute 27.3 per cent of the 22 Anglophone African countries. Although conditions vary from one country to another, the findings of this survey may be considered

a fair representation of the teacher issues in sub-Saharan anglophone African countries. The table below shows some of the six

countries' basic demographic indicators. The statistics refer to the year 2005.

**Table 1: Participating countries at a glance (2005)**

	Gambia	Kenya	Lesotho	Tanzania	Uganda	Zambia
Population, total (millions)	1.5	34.3	1.8	38.3	28.8	11.7
Population growth (annual %)	2.6	2.3	-0.2	1.8	3.5	1.6
Surface area (sq. km) (thousands)	11.3	580.4	30.4	945.1	241.0	752.6
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	56.3	48.3	35.6	46.2	48.9	38.1
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	89.0	78.5	80.0	78.4	80.2	102.0
Literacy rate, youth female (% of females ages 15-24)	-	80.7	-	76.2	71.2	66.2
GNI (current US\$) (billions)	0.4	18.0	1.8	12.1	8.5	6.7
GNI per capita, Atlas method (current US\$)	290.0	530.0	960.0	340.0	280.0	490.0
Prevalence of HIV, total (% of population ages 15-49)	2.4	6.1	23.2	6.5	6.7	17.0

Source: World Development Report

As shown above, two of the countries under investigation may be regarded as small states (The Gambia and Lesotho) with a population of less than 2 million each. Three of them may be regarded as large states (Kenya, Tanzania and Uganda), while one of them may be regarded as an average state (Zambia). The HIV prevalence rate is very high in most of the countries. For example, Lesotho has a prevalence rate of 23.2 per cent, while Zambia has an equally high rate of 17 per cent. In Kenya, women constitute 61.7 per cent of the adults (15+) living with HIV. According to Avert, an HIV and AIDS charity, Kenya has 1 100 000 AIDS orphans, the fourth highest number in the world.<sup>25</sup>

All the six countries included in this survey have very low Gross National Income (GNI) per capita, with the exception of Lesotho. According to the 2007 *EFA Global Monitoring*

*Report*, over 50 per cent of the population in each country lives on less than \$2 per day. For example, in Zambia, a staggering 87.4 per cent of the population lives on less than \$2 per day. In the Gambia, 82.9 per cent of the population lives on less than the same amount per day. This implies that poverty is a major challenge confronting these countries. Such enormous challenges usually make it difficult for the affected countries to achieve AFA targets and MDGs.

The above table indicates that the pre-primary gross and net enrolment ratios are generally low and below the global average gross enrolment ratio of 37 per cent, except for Kenya. At primary level, the gross and net enrolment ratios are higher, except for the Gambia, whose ratios are 81 and 65 per cent, respectively. At secondary level, the gross and net enrolment ratios are very low, except for

<sup>25</sup> This information is available on the Avert web site: [www.avert.org](http://www.avert.org)

**Table 2: Education indicators in the participating countries**

	Gambia	Kenya	Lesotho	Tanzania	Uganda	Zambia
Gross Enrolment Ratio (Pre-primary-2004)	18	53	31	29	2	-
Gross Enrolment Ratio (Primary-2004)	81	111	131	106	118	106
Gross Enrolment Ratio (secondary, 2004)	59	87	45	-	16	26
Net enrolment ratio (pre-primary, 2004)	-	29	-	29	-	-
Net enrolment ratio (pre-primary, 2004)	65	76	86	91	-	91
Net enrolment ratio (secondary, 2004)	47	40	23	-	13	24
School life expectancy (1999)	7.8	9.9	10.9	5.1	10.4	6.5
Adult literacy rate (2004)	26	74	82	69	67	68
Transition rate (primary to secondary, 2003)	-	95	63	33	36	54
Drop-out rate (primary, 2003)	-	27.2	43.1	26.6	59.3	12.5

Source: EFA Global Monitoring Report, 2007

The Gambia and Kenya. However, the Gross Enrolment Ratio (GER) of 87 per cent is influenced by the grade 8 GER, while the transition rate of 95 per cent reflects transition from grade 7 to 8(both primary), as opposed to transition from primary to secondary level. The actual primary to secondary transition rate (Grade 8 to 9) stood at 60 per cent in 2007. Lesotho's adult literacy rate is very low (26 per cent) and below half of that of other countries in the region. The drop out rate is generally high, particularly for Lesotho and Uganda (43.1 and 59.3 per cent, respectively).

## Summary of main findings

### **Teacher supply**

Four of the six countries involved in the survey (66.7%) had a shortage of qualified teachers. These are The Gambia, Lesotho, Tanzania and Uganda. The shortages affect both primary and secondary levels. For example, in 2006, 44 per cent of the primary school teachers and 42 per cent of the secondary school teachers in Lesotho were unqualified.

Kenya and Zambia do not have adequate teachers in their schools (evidenced by high pupil-teacher ratios), yet they have so many qualified teachers roaming the streets. These countries have failed to significantly increase their teacher stock due to budgetary considerations and agreements reached with international financial institutions.

Teacher shortages seem to be more acute in remote rural areas. All six countries have a shortage of mathematics and science teachers. However, the shortages are less acute in Kenya, due to the country's programme to train, recruit and retain mathematics and science teachers. The region needs to increase output from its teacher training institutions and to recruit and retain qualified teachers, including mathematics, science and Information and Communication Technology (ICT) teachers.

### **Teacher attrition**

The average rate of teacher attrition in the six countries is 4 per cent. Most of the attrition is

**Table 3: Teachers' gross salaries per month in US\$ (2006)**

Level	The Gambia	Kenya	Lesotho	Uganda	Tanzania	Zambia
Primary	60	152	177	115	20	200
Lower secondary	75	272	265	144	95	250
Upper secondary	90	305	638	260	125	325

attributed to retirement, resignations, death and dismissals. Many respondents felt that death due to AIDS related illnesses has contributed to the high rate of attrition, especially in Lesotho and Zambia. Brain drain has also contributed to the high level of teacher attrition in Zambia, particularly at secondary level.

The main cause of brain drain was cited as low salaries and poor conditions of service. Therefore, the best way of reducing teacher attrition is to address its root causes, particularly HIV and AIDS, low salaries and poor working conditions.

#### ***Teacher remuneration and motivation***

The survey reveals that teachers' salaries are generally low and below the poverty datum line or cost of living. Conditions of service are also poor and many schools do not have accommodation, or adequate accommodation for teachers. The situation is even worse for unqualified teachers, most of whom earn between 40 and 60 per cent of the salary of the lowest paid qualified teacher. The table below shows the gross salaries of teachers in the six countries in US dollars.

The low salaries and poor conditions of service have contributed to the high level of brain drain in countries like Zambia, and to a general decline in the status of the teaching profession in all the six countries. As a result, teaching has become a stepping stone or a profession of last resort in many of the countries visited. For example, in Tanzania, some teachers have discouraged their own children from taking up teaching as a career. There is an urgent need to improve the teachers' conditions of service.

All the countries surveyed did not have proper or effective collective bargaining structures in place, except Kenya. For example, in The Gambia, the salaries of civil servants, including teachers, are determined by a commission, while in Tanzania they are usually determined and announced by the country's political leadership (usually during state occasions). The trade union leaders in all the six countries expressed the need for training in collective bargaining/negotiations, policy development and advocacy. They indicated that they were not fully equipped or prepared to confront influential international, regional and national financial institutions, donor organisations and other stakeholders on a level playing field. Teacher absenteeism

Teacher absenteeism was reported to be a problem (not a major one, though) in 50 per cent of the countries (Lesotho, Tanzania and Zambia). The main causes were irregular pay days (e.g. in Tanzania and Zambia) and illness, probably related to HIV and AIDS. Teachers from rural areas usually travel to urban areas or district centres to collect their pay and this may take up to 3 or more days, especially when the processing of salaries is delayed. Meanwhile, the pupils or students would be losing valuable learning time, while the few teachers who might have remained at the school would be overburdened with heavy teaching loads. Teacher absenteeism may be addressed by regularising the pay days and by scaling up HIV and AIDS activities.

#### **Union involvement in policy development**

Teacher unions are generally involved in policy development. However, in most cases, the involvement comes at a later stage of the policy making process and is not

institutionalised. However, in countries like The Gambia, Kenya and Uganda, the involvement of the union is provided for in the country's legal statutes, such as the Education Act or in the education policy papers or plans. Generally, all the unions were working closely with civil society organisations like Education for All (EFA) country coalitions and this strengthened their ability to influence education policy. Active involvement in educational or professional issues, over and

above the bread and butter issues, earned the unions a lot of respect from the government and other stakeholders. However, the unions should ensure that they maintain a fair balance between their trade union and professional roles. Collaboration between the EI affiliates and UN agencies, such as UNESCO, UNICEF and the World Bank, was either weak or non-existent, in most countries, and needs to be strengthened.

---

## Recommendations

### Recommendations to teachers' unions

The teachers' unions should:

- |  |  |
|--|--|
| <p>R1 Oppose the recruitment of unqualified teachers and lobby their governments to train and recruit more qualified teachers. This should include both pre-service and in-service training targeted at unqualified and under qualified teachers.</p>  | <p>partnership with the World Health Organisation (WHO) and the Education Development Center (EDC), and implemented by the unions, has made tremendous impact. This was confirmed by the unions in all the 5 countries involved in the programme, with the exception of the Gambia, which is not. The Programme should be continued and expanded to reach as many beneficiaries as possible, within the shortest period of time.</p>   |
| <p>R2 Influence the content and format, including duration, of teacher education and training programmes. The unions should strongly oppose the introduction or continuation of crash programmes such as the Distance Teacher Education Programme (DTEP) in Lesotho and the licence teacher programme in Tanzania.</p> | <p>R5 Lobby their governments to set up, or improve upon existing collective bargaining structures. Those countries without an effective collective bargaining framework may learn from their counterparts in other countries, as was the case with Zambia, which sent government and trade union leaders to South Africa for the above purpose. Collective bargaining structures and systems should be fully grounded in ILO Conventions and conform with international labour standards and norms.</p> |
| <p>R3 Recruit unqualified, volunteer, contract or para teachers as members and make representations to governments on behalf of these teachers.</p>  | <p>R6 Fight for the improvement of teachers' salaries and other conditions of service, including accommodation and incentives to attract teachers to remote rural areas. R7. Lobby their governments to regularise pay days, where necessary, in order to reduce teacher absenteeism</p>   |
| <p>R4 Scale up HIV and AIDS education and support programmes for their members and students in order to reduce the impact of the pandemic on the education sector. The EFAIDS Programme, initiated by EI, in</p>   |  |

and minimise disruption to teaching and inconvenience to teachers and other education employees.

---

R8 Strike and maintain a fair balance between trade union and professional roles. Such a balance means teacher trade unions should fight, not only for bread and butter issues (for the improvement of the teachers' conditions of service), but also for access to quality publicly funded education for all.

---

R9 Collaborate and work very closely with civil society organisations and other bodies, particularly the EFA country coalitions.

---

R10 Collaborate and work very closely with UN agencies such as UNESCO, UNICEF the World Bank and others in promoting quality public education for all.

## Recommendations to governments

Governments should:

---

R16 Train more qualified teachers. This should include both pre-service and in-service training targeted at unqualified and under qualified teachers. This calls for institutional capacity building and expansion. For example, countries like Zambia and Tanzania may consider upgrading some of their primary teacher training colleges to secondary or high school teacher training institutions.

---

R17 Organise and carry out in-service and support programmes for qualified teachers in collaboration with teachers' unions. Such training programmes may focus on school leadership, Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) and on other specific subject areas and pedagogy.

---

R18 Recruit more teachers in order to meet the Education for All (EFA) targets and education related Millennium

Development Goals (MDGs). This may call for the raising of a country's teacher stock in line with enrolment trends, with a view to keeping the pupil-teacher ratios in line with international norms and standards. Governments should avoid setting unrealistic targets or staff/wage bill caps in their agreements with regional or international financial institutions.

---

R19 Strengthen distance teacher training programmes, where these exist, for example, by increasing the period of initial/pre-service training.

---

R20 Increase educator's salaries so that they are in line with the cost of living prevailing in the country and above the poverty datum line. Improve the education employees' general conditions of service. This should include the provision of accommodation, the payment of allowances and other fringe benefits. Efforts should be made to improve the status of teaching and to make the teaching profession attractive to the best school leavers. The Fast Track Initiative (FTI) norm that teachers' salaries be 3.5 times GDP per capita, given in the EFA Indicative Framework, should not be a barrier to increasing the teachers' salaries, as it is a mere guide (it is only meant to be indicative, not prescriptive).

---

R21 Regularise paydays, where necessary, and ensure that these are adhered to by local or paying authorities. Since most salary delays seem to occur where the payment of teachers' salaries is done through local authorities, the Governments may consider centralising the payment of salaries. This may be done electronically through the banks.

---

R22 Ensure that there is a clear career path for teachers and other education employees. Such a path may include the promotion structure, parallel progression and salary upgrading.



---

R23 Engage teacher trade unions, associations and organisations and consult with them on educational, labour and other relevant issues in an institutionalised manner. Such institutionalised dialogue enriches educational policies and ensures ownership on the part of the union.

### **Recommendations to regional and international financial institutions**

The regional and international financial institutions such as the African Development Bank, the World Bank and the IMF should:

---

R24 Desist from supporting or encouraging the recruitment of unqualified, contract or para- teachers, as this negatively affects the quality of education.

---

R25 Avoid setting up unrealistic targets and caps on teacher establishments and educators' salaries, to be met by recipient countries. The FTI norm that teachers' salaries be 3.5 times GDP per capita, given in the EFA Indicative Framework, should not be used as a barrier to increasing the teachers' salaries. The framework should be considered indicative, not prescriptive, as is often the case when it comes to approving country plans.

---

R26 Continue to support educational programmes, including access to early childhood education programmes, free primary education and secondary and tertiary education of good quality, teacher training, institutional capacity building and other progressive educational initiatives.

